History and Economic Anthropology: the Historian's Search for Economic Man in Africa

THOMAS W. ROBISHEAUX*

Historians confront a common methodological problem when analyzing economic change in pre-industrial societies: the application of formal economic theory. European historians, for example, are familiar with the controversy generated by Douglass North and Robert Thomas over their systematic use of economic theory to explain the rise of the Western European economy since the early Middle Ages.[1] While some historians applauded their use of theory to explain pre-industrial European history, others doubted the relevance of an interpretive framework deduced from modern industrial societies and applied to radically different economies in the past. As one critic remarked, "the economic conduct of medieval lords or peasants should not be assumed to follow the precepts of modern theory without demonstration."[2] This theoretical controversy may seem familiar to historians in other fields as well. African historians, however, made this debate into a central historiographical theme by borrowing from two opposing schools of economic anthropology: one school supporting, the other rejecting the use of formal economic theory in studying pre-industrial societies. A review of the historiography in this field clarifies the particular issues in African economic history and also provides a case study of how historians have used the insights of economic anthropology and formal economics to understand economic history in pre-industrial societies.

Two schools of economic anthropology have evolved from the debate over the use of formal economic theory. One school, the substantivists, drew a sharp distinction between African non-market economies and Western market economies. Substantivists argued that social institutions, not markets,

---

* Mr. Robisheaux, the third prize winner, holds an A.B. from Duke University and is currently working toward a Ph.D. in early modern European history at the University of Virginia. African history is his minor field. The author wishes to express gratitude to Professor Joseph C. Miller for his criticism of and support for earlier versions of this paper. William W. Hoest and John T. Kneebone also deserve thanks for their useful comments and suggestions.

distributed material goods according to social, not economic, values. Since social institutions prevented the free operation of the market principle, modern economic theory dealing with market allocation of scarce resources could not be used to explain the dynamics of these societies. The formalist school, on the other hand, argued that formal economic theory could be applied to Africans as well as Westerners since all men pursued economic goals. For the substantivists, economic man was not indigenous to African societies; he was born only in response to Western economic forces. The formalists believed that economic man had always existed in Africa; it was simply a matter of using the right methodology, that is, neo-classical economic theory, to find him.

African economic historians made this debate an historiographical theme by borrowing substantivist theory to explain unresearched aspects of African economies. Early historians who, for example, concentrated on the role of European trade in Africa, were predisposed to use substantivist theory in explaining the apparently static nature of local African economies. By relying on this theory, however, historians made the substantivist issue of response to the market a major historical problem. How exactly did economic change occur in societies which did not respond to economic forces? Historians slowly resolved this paradox by researching African market mechanisms and production. This research undermined substantivist theory by showing that Africans actually took advantage of economic change. Economic theory appeared to explain more than just long-distance trade with Europeans, and the once dominant substantivist theory came under increasing attack from historians using formal economic theory to explain historical change. While research demonstrated the relevance of formal theory, however, it also tended to confirm the substantivist emphasis on the radically different institutional context of economics in African societies. Thus, in attempting to explain economic change in Africa, historians proved the usefulness of both substantivist economic anthropology and formal economic theory.

Substantivists and Formalists

Karl Polanyi first formulated the substantivist theory which economic anthropologists later adopted.[3] According to Polanyi, individuals in a market economy select freely from alternative commodities to satisfy their material needs. Formal economic theory is designed to analyze scientifically this free flow of rational calculation which appears as the forces of supply and demand. Markets, however, have operated freely only in modern Western history. In pre-market or non-market economies, such as Africa before contact with European economic forces, individuals could not select freely from unlimited material goods. The distribution of material goods occurred through social institutions created to preserve social stability. These institutions, such as kinship groups, political institutions, and religious organizations, embedded the economy in a web of social and political values in order to protect the society from the disruptive effects of conflict over scarce material resources. The relevance of formal economic theory, Polanyi concluded, was limited to modern market economies. In non-market economies, one studied the social institutions.

Polanyi's institutional distinction between market and non-market economies implied sharp contrasts in the ways that the societies confronted economic change. Non-market economies were static, resisted change, and crumbled when market forces transformed social goods into commodities. Market economies, on the other hand, exploited economic opportunities which resulted from change. Also, their currencies functioned in opposite ways. In non-market economies, people developed "special purpose" currencies in order to restrict the distribution of goods within specially-defined spheres without reducing all goods to one system of equivalents. Market economies, however, used "general purpose" currencies to facilitate free exchange of all goods. Polanyi reasoned that the "special purpose" currencies in non-market economies shielded production decisions from fluctuations in market prices. Social values channelled production to meet the needs of a subsistence economy, thereby protecting social relations from the whims of an alien, uncontrollable market. This isolation of production from the market contrasted with market economies in which supply and demand directly affected production. Although Polanyi directly applied this theory to only a few historical cases, his work provided an appealing framework for scholars concerned with pre-industrial societies.[4]

George Dalton and Paul Bohannan began the substantivist school of economic anthropology by applying Polanyi's theory to studies of African economies.[5] By using criteria based on market integration, Dalton and Bohannan expanded Polanyi's framework to describe three types of economies. The first type included societies without markets which distributed goods exclusively through social institutions. Societies in a second category had peripheral markets which distributed some goods through market exchange, but social institutions continued to control access to the main sources of subsistence (land, labor, and food). The third type referred to market economies which used the market to allocate all material resources. In the first two types, the circulation of goods within the society actually reflected social obligations expressed in material terms as reciprocity and redistribution. The various social relationships distributed material goods within several spheres, creating a "multicentric economy" understandable only in terms of the social institutions. "Special purpose" currencies operated within each sphere to prohibit material goods from acquiring generalized values. The introduction of a "general purpose" currency, however, broke down the distinctions between spheres and reduced everything to commodities. This occurred especially after contact with Western economic forces expanded the once limited sphere of market exchange and reduced the importance of non-market spheres. A "dual economy" resulted in which the "modern sector" responded to economic forces, and social institutions continued to dominate the "traditional sector." [6] The substantivists applied these theories to their field work among different ethno-linguistic groups in Africa, Paul and Laura Bohannan's work on the Tiv representing the classic substantivist approach.[7]

Claude Meillassoux gave the substantivist approach a provocative Marxist twist by focusing on the social institution of kinship as the mode of production in segmented lineage societies.[8] These societies depended less on the control of the material means of production (land, equipment, and animals), factors which modern economic theory considered important. Instead, these societies valued kinship ties in order to insure the availability of labor to work the land. The importance of acquiring human labor led kinship groups to control the distribution of women, the only way of assuring the reproduction of the group. The emphasis on kinship ties also created dependent relationships within the family between junior males and the elders who controlled land, women, symbols of social status, and political power. Meillassoux developed this theory partly as a result of his field work among the Gouro of the Ivory Coast.[9] Gouro lineage elders, Meillassoux observed, exploited the dependent status of the junior males in order to mobilize labor. Lineage organization as a whole protected this forest society from the potentially disruptive effects of trade with the savanna by converting trade goods into symbols of social status. This system broke down only when the French colonial government forced the Gouro to pay taxes and produce cash crops, thereby replacing the kinship mode of production with landlord/tenant relations. The Marxist theory and terminology did not obscure the substantivist orientation of Meillassoux's work. His work offered a significant new approach to understanding the social organization of production in small-scale societies.[10]

While the substantivists emphasized a social approach to African economies, the formalist school of economic anthropology insisted on the use of formal economic theory. Raymond Firth, one of the leaders of this school, argued that all societies confronted the common problem of rationally allocating scarce material resources.[11] Economic calculation played a role even in the social distribution of goods which the substantivists emphasized. Formal economic theory, Firth noted, provided cross-cultural concepts for analyzing the allocation of scarce resources. Frederick Barth's study of Dar Fur seemed to confirm the usefulness of economic theory in explaining some aspects of African agriculture.[12] Barth noted that Fur farmers calculated labor, land, and capital inputs to expand their production. They grew tomatoes and millet for sale on the market and used the profits to buy more land, equipment, labor, and wives. In other words, the Fur organized their society to meet economic goals.

While the two schools of economic anthropology continued to debate the relevance of economic theory,[13] historians brought the controversy into the developing field of African economic history by borrowing substantivist theories to explain unresearched historical problems. In doing so, African historians directly confronted the controversy over formal economic theory which the two schools of economic anthropology had clearly formulated. The theoretical issue, however, created an important historical problem. If Africans did not respond to the market principle, how could the historian explain economic change in Africa? In answering this question, historians turned to the empirical evidence concerning mechanisms of the market and the organization of production. The existence of African economic man became an historical issue.

Trade and Politics in African History

Before becoming an independent historical field in the early 1960's, African history formed an aspect of European imperial or colonial history. Imperial economic history focused on Europeans as the agents of economic change in Africa, an approach which corresponded to substantivist assumptions that static African economies were incapable of generating change themselves. Early imperial economic histories, such as the classic study of British West Africa by Allan McPhee, ignored African economies almost completely; Europeans alone brought progressive economic change to Africa in the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries.[14] Later colonial economic histories continued the substantivist bias by emphasizing the dynamics of European economic forces in contrast to the static African subsistence economies.[15]

While early African historians expanded this focus to explore the impact of trade on Africans, they also accepted essentially substantivist assumptions about African economies. The effects of the Atlantic slave trade attracted particular attention since historically it formed the first major link between Europe and Africa. J.D. Fage, in the first major synthesis of West African history, associated the rise of the large-scale states of Benin, Dahomey, Ashanti, and Oyo with the Atlantic slave trade.[16] Basil Davidson, while noting the effects of the slave trade on demographic and economic development, emphasized the particularly harmful influence it had on African political history.[17] Although historians disagreed over the positive and negative effects of European trade on African states, they all tended to ignore the internal African potential for economic change.[18] Later, this approach predisposed African historians to accept substantivist theories about the subsistence economy while they concentrated on the interrelationship of long-distance trade and politics.

In 1962, Jan Vansina systematically formulated the implicit connection of trade and political change into a framework corresponding closely to that of Dalton and Bohannan.[19] Using geographical instead of market criteria, Vansina distinguished three types of precolonial trade: local, regional, and long-distance. Local trade circulated subsistence goods at the village level. Regional trade encompassed the trade relationships between several states. Long-distance trade with Europe, however, proved to be the most important since it expanded continuously between the fifteenth and the nineteenth centuries and directly affected the political fortunes of the major states in Central Africa. While Vansina emphasized the geography and not the structure of trade like Dalton and Bohannan, his framework implied that static local economies changed only after contact with European traders developed after the fifteenth century.

Richard Gray and David Birmingham accepted Vansina's basic distinction between local and long-distance trade, but explicitly fitted it to the substantivist structural distinction between "subsistence-oriented trade" and "market-oriented trade."[20] Adopting Meillassoux's substantivist framework, Gray and Birmingham argued that kinship groups controlled the subsistence economy. No economic change occurred in this sphere because social constraints shackled any impulse towards innovation and economic specialization.[21] Goods only acquired economic value when they entered "market-oriented trade," thereby making this sector of the economy capable of change:

> The significant contrast to subsistence-oriented trade is then the phase in which trade freed itself from these subsistence and kinship shackles, and a market-oriented trade began to create a number of far-reaching economic innovations directly dependent on commercial opportunities.[22]

The key to this change, Gray and Birmingham argued, was the appearance of a unified currency system which transformed all goods into market commodities.

Gray and Birmingham's introduction to *Pre-Colonial African Trade* linked the historians' study of long-distance trade directly with the substantivist school of economic anthropology. The substantivist framework conveniently corresponded to the implicit assumptions of the "trade and politics" genre by providing theoretical analysis of local economies which historians had not researched. This genre contributed significant insights into the intricate relationship of trade and political institutions, social structures, and demography in many regions of Africa.[23] But by accepting substantivist theory, historians created a difficult historical problem: how did economic change occur in pre-industrial African societies if they did not respond to economic incentives? Only research into market mechanisms, such as credit, debt, prices, currency conversions, and the institutional structure of trade, could test the underlying substantivist assumptions.[24]

A.G. Hopkins and Formal Economic Theory

While substantivist theory filled a temporary void in historical analysis, research into market mechanisms began to undermine its theoretical framework. Marion Johnson's studies of the West African currencies, the gold *mithqal*,[25] ounce,[26] and cowries,[27] showed that general purpose currencies existed with flexible conversion systems to facilitate commercial transactions. A.J.H. Latham's research on the Tiv copper rod currency directly attacked Bohannan's substantivist theory that it was a "special purpose" currency.[28] Latham demonstrated that copper bars formed a unified standard for many commodities and were instrumental in expanding trade with Europeans. C.W. Newbury's research on nineteenth-century credit systems in West Africa indicated that ambitious Africans skillfully exploited credit connections within the existing economic network to finance expanded trade with Europeans.[29] These studies raised doubts about the empirical validity of the substantivist theory that African currencies discouraged market exchange. On the contrary, they suggested that African economies could quickly exploit new market opportunities by using indigenous market mechanisms.

The ability of the "non-market economies" to adapt rapidly to economic change, in fact, challenged the relevance of substantivist theory to many African societies. This theme appeared at the Tenth International African Seminar in 1969, a conference focusing on the reactions of West African societies to the ending of the slave trade in the nineteenth century.[30] The papers indicated that African social structures responded quickly to economic incentives for producing alternative products to sell in new markets. The Akan, for example, responded to the decline of the slave trade by shifting labor and capital resources into kola nut production for export to the Hausa.[31] Later in the century, they reacted to the disruption of the Hausa trade by developing new markets with the savanna.[32]

Of the articles discussed at the seminar, Abner Cohen's represented a direct challenge to the substantivist theory that social institutions dominated African economies.[33] Cohen developed the concept of a "trading diaspora" which he defined as a "nation of socially interdependent, but spatially dispersed, communities" connected by common commercial interests.[34] Each trading diaspora used its unique ethnic, cultural, religious, linguistic, and social characteristics to facilitate the smooth operation of trading networks among many different ethno-linguistic groups. Merchants, for example, used kinship ties to mobilize labor, raise capital, and provide insurance against economic reverses. Religious affiliation provided a framework of mutual trust as well as a reliable communication network. Political organizations resolved business conflicts and provided security against losses. The Hausa of Northern Nigeria, Cohen argued, were the classic example of a trading people which had continuously adapted their social institutions to economic change.

Many of these historical studies hinted at a formalist critique of substantivist theory. But A.G. Hopkins first integrated this research into a systematic re-interpretation of West African history using formal economic theory.[35] Hopkins rejected the substantivist interpretation that social institutions limited economic development in Africa. He sought instead economic reasons for West Africa's restricted economic growth before the nineteenth century:

> The problem [of West African economic history] ceases to be one of introducing exchange to closed, self-sufficient communities where wants are limited and commercial institutions nonexistent, and becomes the more realistic and interesting issue of identifying the constraints inhibiting the further development of an already established exchange sector.[36]

Economic constraints, such as high transportation costs, a high land/labor ratio, and low per capita income, combined to inhibit market growth.[37] High costs of production and distribution before the nineteenth century limited commerce to primarily expensive, easily transported luxury goods. Merchants and chiefs therefore invested commercial profits in slaves and luxuries and not in industry and technology.

Although Hopkins rejected the substantivist logic explaining why there was little economic growth in Africa before the nineteenth century, he concluded with the substantivists that Africans valued human labor (slaves and kinsmen) and social status (symbolized in luxuries) more than material growth. Hopkins merely reformulated these substantivist conclusions in the language of formal theory by offering economic explanations for African social values. Hopkins's economic constraints to growth were reminiscent of Dalton and Bohannan's social barriers which restricted economic forces. In analyzing West African economies before 1900, Hopkins advanced a formalist explanation for what continued to be substantivist conclusions.

If Hopkins's re-interpretation supported substantivist theory about precolonial African social values, it shattered the substantivist myth that static African economies resisted economic change. Using the "vent-for-surplus" model, Hopkins showed that the export market expanded tremendously in the nineteenth century.[38] West Africans recognized a growing market for vegetable oils in Europe, and producers mobilized labor and capital to expand production. This development brought large numbers of West Africans into the market economy, increased their income, and stimulated domestic consumption. Improved currencies and credit systems facilitated the rapid growth of a new West African export economy. In the colonial period, the export economy experienced unprecedented growth as more Africans produced for the market. West Africa societies did not resist change or crumble when confronted with new market opportunities. They mobilized resources through existing institutions to take advantage of changing economic conditions.

By showing that Africans responded to economic opportunities, Hopkins's work demonstrated the usefulness of formal theory in explaining economic change in Africa. Other African historians using the results of further historical research continued to undermine the substantivist model of static, unresponsive African economies. Edward Reynolds studied in greater detail the transition from the export of slaves to the export of natural products on the Gold Coast between 1807 and 1874.[39] Sara Berry analyzed the resourceful ways in which Western Nigerian cocoa farmers used their kinship system to mobilize labor in building successful farms.[40] George Brooks noted that groundnut producers along the Upper Guinea Coast quickly exhausted local sources of labor when production increased dramatically in the nineteenth century. In order to solve the labor shortage problem, farmers recruited labor from the interior.[41] Even the Tiv, a people which Bohannan characterized as non-market oriented, exploited new market opportunities by producing benniseeds for export.[42] Robert Harms applied the growth of the market concept to explain how Africans exploited rubber resources in the Congo region at the end of the nineteenth century.[43] Lately, research in market mechanisms has turned toward Western business institutions which helped Africans take advantage of new market opportunities.[44]

Although economic historians using formal theory of market growth supported some substantivist conclusions about precolonial African economies, they injected dynamic change into an otherwise static model. By focusing on the historical role of market mechanisms, they demonstrated that African economies did not crumble when confronted with economic change, but simply adapted existing institutions to meet new needs. Substantivist theory underestimated not only the potential for change inherent in precolonial African economies, but also the value of formal theory in explaining how economic change occurred.

Neo-Marxists and Underdevelopment

While some historians challenged substantivism from a formalist perspective, neo-Marxist historians tended to reinforce substantivist theory. By emphasizing the role of Western capitalism as the agent of dynamic economic change, most neo-Marxists readily accepted a substantivist view of Africans living in egalitarian, subsistence-oriented economies until European trade skewed their economic development. But this approach, while contributing important work on the effects of European involvement in Africa, also tended to ignore the internal dynamics of precolonial African economies.

Neo-Marxists' interest in the origins of underdevelopment in Africa predisposed them to integrate substantivist assumptions into their historical work. Walter Rodney first formulated the underdevelopment thesis for Africa, arguing that Africans produced for local social needs until European trade forced them to produce for the world market beginning in the fifteenth century.[45] Edward Alpers adapted this theory to his study of the origins of underdevelopment in East Central Africa, a work which assumed subsistence-oriented African economies until international trade caused sweeping change.[46] John Iliffe's study of Tanganyika and Roger van Zwanenberg's similar work on Kenya contributed to an understanding of the economic effects of white settler agriculture on Africans, although both preserved substantivist assumptions about static precolonial African economies.[47]

Some neo-Marxist historians sharpened their analyses of the effects of European businesses on Africans by using formal economic theory, although this implicitly reinforced the substantivist theory that African economies alone were incapable of generating change. Catherine Coquery-Vidrovitch, for example, applied formal theory as an analytical tool to explain the economic history of French colonial businesses in Africa. Using the extensive public records of the French companies in the Middle Congo, she reconstructed the history of profit rates, investments, costs, and export volume of the concessionary companies in French Equatorial Africa.[48] She argued that the companies' primitive and short-sighted financial practices contributed to chronic under-investment problems and labor shortages culminating in economic collapse at the end of the rubber boom in 1913.[49] The companies stagnated until the late 1920's when new financial policies reversed the situation. These policies helped explain the companies' brutal treatment of African laborers during this period. In a similar way, Coquery-Vidrovitch explained the history of the two trading companies of French West Africa.[50]

While Coquery-Vidrovitch restricted the use of formal theory to Western businesses in Africa, Giovanni Arrighi, a neo-Marxist developmental economist, expanded its scope to analyze the internal economic conditions of African peasantries in white settler societies. In a brilliant article on the development of wage labor in Rhodesia, Arrighi exploded the substantivist myth that African peasants did not respond rationally to economic incentives.[51] Arrighi argued that African peasants resisted working for wages in the settler economy as long as traditional agriculture offered a higher level of income. African peasants sought wage employment only when the settlers and the government denied them access to agricultural markets, forced them to pay taxes in cash, and confiscated their land. Developmental economists previously had analyzed the apparently erratic response of peasants to wage incentives by referring to the substantivist theory of "dual economies" and the irrational behavior expected from "backward-bending labor-supply curves."[52] By shifting the focus away from the Europeans, Arrighi and historians influenced by him showed that African peasants understood how to protect their economic interests.[53] Arrighi's work indicated once again that historical research on the internal structure of African economies undermined substantivist theory and demonstrated the usefulness of formal economic theory.

Philip Curtin: the Reconciliation of Formalist and Substantivist Theory

While neo-classical and neo-Marxist historians made significant contributions to African economic history, they also tended to perpetuate the dichotomy between formalist and substantivist theory. By concentrating their efforts on the great changes in the nineteenth century, they sometimes neglected patterns of internal African change before the dominance of European trade. Often, historians using formal economic theory unjustly underrated the importance of the substantivists' emphasis on institutional variety and social values. On the other hand, historians who accepted substantivist theory overlooked the fact that local African economies underwent constant change. Philip Curtin initiated a significant new trend in African economic history by reconciling formal economic theory with substantivist economic anthropology. This combination enabled Curtin to study the institutional framework of economic change in one region of Africa, Senegambia, with a cautious use of economic theory.

Curtin's early work on interior trade networks and gold production in Senegambia first indicated the potential for combining economic theory and anthropology with historical research. His work on the Diakhanké, for example, showed that these long-distance traders connected the Senegal and Niger rivers to tap the valuable gold and slave trade in the eighteenth century.[54] The traders in this network shifted their trade routes over time to take advantage of changes in prices. Their social structure and religion, however, created a solidarity which enabled them to become successful merchants. In his study of gold production in Bambuhu, Curtin introduced econometric cost analysis to explain the low gold yield from the fields.[55] He found that gold production in Bambuhu was so marginal that it could not even meet the costs of workers' subsistence. Gold mining in Bambuhu yielded no profits as a commercial business. It occurred at all because the political and ecological system supported workers engaged in the unprofitable enterprise. Though using formal economic theory, Curtin demonstrated a substantivist point that gold production in Senegambia was understandable only within the broader social and political institutional framework.

Curtin's book, *Economic Change in Precolonial Africa*, showed even more clearly the usefulness of combining substantivist economic anthropology with formal theory in reconstructing patterns of economic change in Senegambia.[56] Curtin used econometric methodology, but noted that generalizations based only on Western economic patterns could not be applied mechanically to analyses of pre-industrial African economies. Curtin argued that a sensitive "historical economic anthropology" would reinterpret the principles of formal theory to fit Senegambian circumstances.[57] On the other hand, while he accepted the substantivist emphasis upon the unique institutional framework of economics in pre-industrial societies, Curtin rejected the notion that these economies remained static and resisted change. The trading diasporas of the Soninke, Jahaanke, and Malinke Mori, for example, experienced patterns of change that depended on market conditions, political situations, and climate changes. Currencies, monetary zones, and exchange rates also changed in response to new economic and political conditions. Commercial institutions, such as transport networks, cross-cultural brokering systems, and elaborate credit mechanisms, reacted dynamically to changing economic, political, and social forces.

In addition to showing that Senegambian economic institutions constantly changed, Curtin's research also refuted the substantivist idea that African economies were basically "subsistence-oriented." Senegambia, he showed, produced a wide variety of products for the market, including cotton textiles, gum, iron, cattle, beeswax, ivory, salt, and kola nuts. Substantivists greatly underestimated the extent of market exchange in precolonial Senegambia. But Curtin agreed with the substantivists that most goods continued to circulate within local social institutions:

> In spite of an active market in all these goods, the market sector of the eighteenth-century Senegambian economy was smaller than the self-subsistence sector. Most goods and services were produced and consumed within the household, usually a not very extended family. Distribution of goods within the household was no doubt based on currents of reciprocity and redistribution reflecting social patterns rather than the allocation of scarce resources.[58]

Elsewhere, though using formal economic theory to construct economic models, Curtin suggested another substantivist point: Senegambian production did not always respond to market incentives.[59] To analyze the slave trade, for example, he proposed alternative models of enslavement based on economic and non-economic rationales. If slave procurement in Senegambia were an economic process, he reasoned, the supply of slaves would respond to fluctuations in market prices. If, on the other hand, slaves were the by-product of political actions (wars and judicial enslavement), the supply of slaves would tend not to respond to price fluctuations. Statistics showed that Senegambian slave exports actually dropped steadily throughout the eighteenth century even though prices on the coast rose dramatically. Thus, Senegambian enslavement, just like gold production in Bambuhu, appeared to be embedded in political and social structures which made it relatively unresponsive to changes in market prices.[60]

While reinforcing substantivist insights in explaining the institutional framework of the Senegambian economies, Curtin applied formalist theory to analyze the complexities of currencies.

His analysis of iron bar currency, for example, penetrated beyond a substantivist façade of apparently fixed prices to show that market values actually fluctuated with variations in assortment bundles and did not remain static as official prices suggested.[61] Formal theory not only explained the mystery of iron bars, it also revealed the relationships between monetary zones using other currencies, such as cloth and cowries; systems of currency equivalents facilitated conversions.

Elsewhere, Curtin used export-import indices to establish a formalist standard for measuring the terms of trade between Senegambia and Europe. He showed that imports conformed to Senegambian demand for consumer and nonproductive goods.[62] To use substantivist terminology, Senegambians remained uninterested in acquiring materials for economic growth in the eighteenth century; they preferred to use their buying power for "non-economic consumption."

By reconciling formalist theory with substantivist economic anthropology, Curtin initiated a new trend towards understanding the unique patterns of economic change in precolonial Africa.[63] Using some of the insights of Curtin and expanding on Marion Johnson's work on cowrie currencies, Paul Lovejoy, for example, analyzed the precolonial regional monetary network extending from the Central Sudan to the Bight of Benin.[64] By noting the monetary interdependence of the region, Lovejoy suggested that changing terms of trade with Europeans on the coast might directly affect peoples from the interior who formed important links in the trade, especially the Hausa.[65]

This new approach proved particularly important in explaining the unique economic patterns characteristic of West African desert economies. Paul Lovejoy and Stephen Baier explained the relationship of the Hausa and Tuareg by noting their interdependence as two ecological economies.[66] Tuareg pastoralists in the desert specialized in trading animal products, salt, and dates to Hausa agriculturalists in the savanna in exchange for grain and manufactures. Tuareg herded their animals into the desert during the rainy season, but relied on their agricultural estates in Hausaland to furnish them with grain. During a drought, the Tuareg withdrew south along their networks into the savanna. After the drought, the terms of trade shifted in favor of the pastoralists as short supplies drove up the prices of animal products. The Tuareg were then able to move back into the desert with smaller herds by supporting themselves with a larger profit per animal. This research on desert economies suggests that Curtin's synthesis of formal theory with an understanding of the institutional framework of market mechanisms and production may prove to be the key to reconstructing precolonial African economic history.

Epilogue

In the debate over the universal relevance of formal economic theory, African historians initially sided with the substantivists. Research into market mechanisms, however, undermined substantivist theory by showing that African institutions responded to economic opportunities and could use them to take advantage of new economic conditions. Historians then began using formal economic theory. Formal theory, such as the vent-for-surplus model, proved more useful in explaining the dynamics of change in African societies which research revealed and which substantivist theory had obscured. In addition, formal theory provided methods for collecting and interpreting statistical data giving additional support to critics of substantivism. This research further indicated that Africans organized extremely complex economic systems which did not fit easily into substantivist categories. But research has provided answers for only a few regions, primarily West Africa. Many questions remain unanswered for most of Central, Southern, and East Africa. In addition, work on market mechanisms should be complemented with more research on the organization of production. As Curtin's work on gold mining indicated, an understanding of production reveals not only the organization of the local economy, but also the relationship of the economy to social and political institutions. In this respect, Claude Meillassoux's substantivist theory of the kinship mode of production may prove particularly useful to historians.

A strictly formalist interpretation, therefore, proves particularly useful when complemented with substantivist sensitivity to local institutional variations. Historical evidence indicating the complex variety of African institutional frameworks supports this conclusion. Philip Curtin's work further suggests that formalist and substantivist theory converge in the interpretation of empirical data. Formalist theory, when applied cautiously to the unique institutional arrangements in different types of economies, provides helpful interpretive insights; formal theory makes sense only in the context of the economic, social, and political institutions of the society under study. Thus, the substantivist/formalist debate has advanced the understanding of economic change in pre-industrial African societies by pointing to the advantages of combining formal theory and economic anthropology with solid empirical research. African historians have usefully drawn from the work of both economists and economic anthropologists. Historians in other fields might similarly benefit from the lesson as well.

NOTES

[1] See Douglass C. North and Robert Paul Thomas, *The Rise of the Western World: a New Economic History* (Cambridge: University Press, 1973).

[2] "The Growth of Europe," rev. of *The Rise of the Western World*, by Douglass C. North and Robert Paul Thomas, *Times Literary Supplement*, 18 January 1974, p. 56.

[3] See Karl Polanyi, "The Economy as Instituted Process," in Karl Polanyi, Conrad M. Arensberg, and Harry W. Pearson, eds., *Trade and Market in the Early Empires* (Glencoe, Ill.: Free Press, 1957), pp. 243-270. For a comprehensive analysis of Polanyi's ideas, see S.C. Humphreys, "History, Economics, and Anthropology: the Work of Karl Polanyi," *History and Theory*, VIII, 2(1969), 165-212. Some anthropologists criticized Polanyi by analyzing the intellectual roots of his assumptions; see Scott Cook, "The Obsolete 'Anti-Market' Mentality: a Critique of the Substantive Approach to Economic Anthropology," *American Anthropologist*, 68, 2(1966), 323-345; and "The 'Anti-Market' Mentality Re-examined: a Further Critique of the Substantive Approach to Economic Anthropology," *Southwestern Journal of Anthropology*, 25, 4(1969), 378-406. David Kaplan defended the issues raised by Polanyi and noted some of the intellectual implications for economists as well as anthropologists; see his article, "The Formal-Substantive Controversy in Economic Anthropology: Reflections on its Wider Implications," *Southwestern Journal of Anthropology*, 24, 3(1968), 228-251. See also the defense by Marshall Sahlins, "Economic Anthropology and Anthropological Economics," *Social Science Information*, VIII, 5(1969), 13-33.

[4] See Polanyi, *Trade and Market*; and his analysis of historical change in England in *The Great Transformation* (New York: Holt, Rinehart, 1944). In regard to Africa, see his article on special purpose currencies, "Sortings and the 'Ounce Trade' in the West African Slave Trade," *Journal of African History*, V, 3(1964), 381-393; and *Dahomey and the Slave Trade* (Seattle: University of Washington Press, 1966). Catherine Coquery-Vidrovitch attacked Polanyi's analysis of trade in Dahomey in

her article, "De la traite des esclaves a l'exportation de l'huile de palme et des palmistes au Dahomey: XIXe siècle," in Claude Meillassoux, ed., *The Development of Indigenous Trade and Markets in West Africa* (Oxford: International African Institute, 1971), pp. 107-123.

[5] Paul Bohannan and George Dalton, "Introduction," in Paul Bohannan and George Dalton, eds., *Markets in Africa* (Evanston: Northwestern University Press, 1962), pp. 1-25. Dalton elaborated substantivist theory even more precisely in his article, "Theoretical Issues in Economic Anthropology," *Current Anthropology,* X, 1(1969), 63-102.

[6] Although Bohannan developed his ideas within an anthropological tradition, he agreed substantially with the concept of "dual economy" first elaborated by J.H. Boeke in *Economics and Economic Policy in Dual Societies* (New York: Institute of Pacific Relations, 1953). Boeke developed the theory as an economist advising the government of Indonesia on economic policies with regard to the "traditional" Indonesian societies. The theory shared common assumptions with the substantivists that "traditional" societies did not respond to economic incentives. It quickly became a part of developmental economic theory in the 1950's. See, for example, B. Higgins, "The Dualistic Theory of Underdeveloped Areas," *Economic Development and Cultural Change,* IV (1956), 99-112.

[7] Paul and Laura Bohannan, *Tiv Economy* (Evanston: Northwestern University Press, 1968); see also Paul Bohannan, "The Impact of Money on an African Subsistence Economy," *Journal of Economic History,* XIX, 4(1959), 491-503; and "Some Principles of Exchange and Investment Among the Tiv," *American Anthropologist,* LVII, 1(1955), 60-70. For some other examples of substantivist field research, see especially Mary Douglas, "Lele Economy Compared with the Bushong: a Study of Economic Backwardness," in *Markets in Africa,* pp. 211-233; and the other studies in *Markets in Africa.* The substantivist approach was implicit in the tradition of British functional anthropology. Even early anthropological studies of African economies emphasized the dominance of social institutions over economic activity. See, for example, Max Gluckman, *Economy of the Central Barotse Plain* (Livingstone, Northern Rhodesia: Rhodes-Livingstone Institute, 1941).

[8] Meillassoux's concept of the kinship mode of production appeared most clearly in his article, "From Reproduction to Production: a Marxist Approach to Economic Anthropology," *Economy and Society,* I, 1(1972), 93-105. His earlier article on subsistence economies, however, influenced African historians in the 1960's, especially Richard Gray and David Birmingham; see "Essai d'interprétation du phénomène économique dans les sociétés traditionnelles d'autosubsistence," *Cahiers d'études africaines,* No. 4, I, 1(1960), 38-67. Meillassoux's work emerged from a long French Marxist tradition which struggled with Marx's concept of the Asiatic mode of production, eventually realizing that it did not explain the dynamics of African social relations. See, for example, Jean Suret-Canale, "Les sociétés traditionnelles en Afrique noire et le concept du mode de production asiatique," *La Pensée,* No. 117 (1964), 19-42; Catherine Coquery-Vidrovitch, "Recherches sur un mode de production africain," *La Pensée,* No. 144 (1969), 61-78; Maurice Godelier, "Modes de production: rapports de parenté et structures demographiques," *La Pensée,* No. 172 (1973), 7-31; Pierre Bonte, "Quelques problèmes théoretiques de la recherche marxiste en anthropologie," *La Pensée,* No. 172 (1973), 86-104; Jacques

Depelchin, "A Contribution to the Study of Pre-Capitalist Modes of Production: Vivra Zone (Eastern Zaire), c. 1800-1937," *African Economic History Review,* II, 1(1975), 1-6; and Emmanuel Terray, "Classes and Class Consciousness in the Abron Kingdom of Gyaman," in Maurice Bloch, ed., *Marxist Analyses and Social Anthropology* (London: Malaby, 1975), pp. 85-135.

[9] Claude Meillassoux, *Anthropologie économique des Gouro de Côte d'Ivorie: de l'économie de subsistance à l'agriculture commerciale* (Paris: Mouton, 1964).

[10] Meillassoux's important reformulation of substantivist theory stimulated interest in the organization of production in African societies. See, for example, his article, "Etat et conditions des esclaves.a Gumbu (Mali) au XIXe siècle," *Journal of African History,* XIV, 3(1973), 429-452; and Claude Meillassoux, ed., *L'esclavage en Afrique precoloniale* (Paris: François Masperd, 1975); and the related article by Michael Mason, "Captive and Client Labor and the Economy of the Bida Emirate, 1857-1901," *Journal of African History,* XIV, 3(1973), 453-471.

[11] Raymond Firth, "Themes in Economic Anthropology: a General Comment," in Raymond Firth, ed., *Themes in Economic Anthropology* (London: Tavistock, 1971), pp. 1-28.

[12] Frederick Barth, "Economic Spheres in Darfur," in *Themes in Economic Anthropology,* pp. 149-174. For a more detailed formalist study, see Harold K. Schneider, *The Wahi Wanyaturu: Economics in an African Society* (Chicago: Aldine, 1970).

[13] Harold K. Schneider's work represents the most recent formulation of the formalist school; see his *Economic Man: the Anthropology of Economics* (New York: Free Press, 1974). For the substantivists, Marshall Sahlins has continued the tradition of Polanyi and Dalton. See his article, "Economic Anthropology and Anthropological Economics"; and *Stone Age Economics* (Chicago: Aldine, 1972). This debate between substantivists and formalists can be traced back to the work of Melville J. Herskovits, *The Economic Life of Primitive Peoples* (New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 1940); and the formalist critique by Frank H. Knight, "Anthropology and Economics," *Journal of Political Economy,* XLIX, 2(1941), 247-268. Both are republished in Melville J. Hersvokits, *Economic Anthropology: the Economic Life of Primitive Peoples* (New York: Norton, 1965).

[14] Allan McPhee, *The Economic Revolution in British West Africa* (London: G. Routledge, 1926); see also the work by K. Onwuka Dike, *Trade and Politics in the Niger Delta, 1830-1885* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1956).

[15] See, for example, Peter Duignan and L.H. Gann, "The Pre-Colonial Economies of Sub-Sahara Africa," in Peter Duignan and L.H. Gann, eds., *Colonialism in Africa* (Cambridge: University Press, 1975), IV, pp. 33-67; and the articles on economic development in D.A. Low and Alison Smith, eds., *History of East Africa,* III (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1976).

[16] J.D. Fage, *An Introduction to the History of West Africa* (Cambridge: University Press, 1955), p. 87.

[17] Basil Davidson, *Black Mother: the Years of the African Slave Trade* (Boston: Little, Brown, 1961), p. 262 ff.

[18] See, for example, the debate between Walter Rodney and J.D. Fage: Walter Rodney, "African Slavery and Other Forms of Social Oppression on the Upper Guinea Coast in the Context of the Atlantic Slave Trade," *Journal of African*

History, VII, 3(1966), 431-443; and J.D. Fage, "Slavery and the Slave Trade in the Context of West African History," *Journal of African History*, X, 3(1969), 393-404.

[19] Jan Vansina, "Long-Distance Trade-Routes in Central Africa," *Journal of African History*, III, 3(1962), 375-390. See also *Kingdoms of the Savanna* (Madison: University of Wisconsin Press, 1966).

[20] Richard Gray and David Birmingham, "Some Economic and Political Consequences of Trade in Central and Eastern Africa in the Pre-Colonial Period," in Richard Gray and David Birmingham, eds., *Pre-Colonial African Trade: Essays on Trade in Central and Eastern Africa before 1900* (London: Oxford University Press, 1970), pp. 1-23.

[21] Gray and Birmingham, "Economic and Political Consequences," p. 5.

[22] Gray and Birmingham, "Economic and Political Consequences," p. 3.

[23] See, for example, the articles in *Pre-Colonial African Trade*; A.G. Hopkins, "Economic Aspects of Political Movements in Nigeria and in the Gold Coast, 1918-1939," *Journal of African History*, VII, 1(1966), 133-152; Patrick Manning, "Slaves, Palm Oil, and Political Power on the West African Coast," *African Historical Studies*, II, 2(1969), 279-288; Eric Flint, "Trade and Politics in Barotseland during the Kololo Period," *Journal of African History*, XI, 1(1970), 71-86; E.J. Alagoa, "The Development of Institutions in the States of the Eastern Niger Delta," *Journal of African History*, XII, 2(1971), 269-278; Ralph A. Austen, "Patterns of Development in Nineteenth-Century East Africa," *African Historical Studies*, IV, 3(1971), 645-658; Beverly Brown, "Muslim Influence on Trade and Politics in the Lake Tanganyika Region," *African Historical Studies*, IV, 3(1971), 617-630; Patricia Mercer, "Shilluk Trade and Politics from the Mid-Seventeenth Century to 1861," *Journal of African History*, XII, 3(1971), 407-426; Martin A. Klein, "Social and Economic Factors in the Muslim Revolution in Senegambia," *Journal of African History*, XIII, 3(1972), 419-441; Anne Wilson, "Long Distance Trade and Luba Lomani Empire," *Journal of African History*, VIII, 4(1972), 575-589; Phares M. Mutibwa, "Trade and Economic Development in Nineteenth Century Madagascar," *Transafrican Journal of History*, II, 1(1972), 33-63; Bolanle Awe, "Militarism and Economic Development in Nineteenth Century Yoruba Country: the Ibadan Example," *Journal of African History*, XIV, 1(1973), 65-77; A.J.H. Latham, *Old Calabar, 1600-1891: the Impact of the International Economy upon a Traditional Society* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1973); Bruce Mouser, "Trader Coaster, and Conflict in the Rio Pongo from 1790-1808," *Journal of African History*, XIV, 1(1973), 45-64; R.S. O'Fahey, "Slavery and the Slave Trade in Dār Fūr," *Journal of African History*, XIV, 1(1973), 29-43; and Gerald W. Hartwig, *The Art of Survival in East Africa: the Kerebe and Long-Distance Trade, 1800-1895* (New York: Africana Publishing Co., 1975).

[24] See the perceptive review by Jan Vansina, "Pre-Colonial Trade," rev. of *Pre-Colonial African Trade*, ed. by Richard Gray and David Birmingham, *Journal of African History*, XI, 4(1970), 611-616.

[25] Marion Johnson, "The Nineteenth-Century Gold 'Mithqal' in West and North Africa," *Journal of African History*, IX, 4(1968), 547-569.

[26] Marion Johnson, "The Ounce in Eighteenth Century West African Trade," *Journal of African History*, VII, 2(1966), 197-214.

[27] Marion Johnson, "The Cowrie Currencies of West Africa," *Journal of African History*, XI, 1(1970), 17-49; 3(1970), 331-353.

[28] A.J.H. Latham, "Currency, Credit and Capitalism on the Cross River in the Precolonial Era," *Journal of African History,* XII, 4(1971), 599-605.

[29] C.W. Newbury, "Credit in the Early Nineteenth Century West African Trade," *Journal of African History,* XIII, 1(1972), 81-95.

[30] Published in Claude Meillassoux, ed., *The Development of Indigenous Trade and Markets in West Africa* (Oxford: International African Institute, 1971).

[31] Ivor Wilks, "Asante Policy Towards the Hausa Trade in the Nineteenth Century," in *The Development of Indigenous Trade,* pp. 124-141.

[32] Kwame Arhin, "Atebubu Markets, ca. 1881-1930," in *The Development of Indigenous Trade,* pp. 199-213.

[33] Abner Cohen, "Cultural Strategies in the Organization of Trading Diasporas," in *The Development of Indigenous Trade,* pp. 266-281.

[34] Cohen, "Trading Diasporas," p. 267.

[35] A.G. Hopkins, *An Economic History of West Africa* (London: Longman, 1973).

[36] Hopkins, *Economic History,* p. 6.

[37] Hopkins, *Economic History,* p. 76.

[38] One can trace the "vent-for surplus" model back to Adam Smith, but Hopkins borrowed his model from a developmental economist; see D. Seers, "The Stages of Economic Development of a Primary Producer in the Middle of the Twentieth Century," *Economic Bulletin of Ghana,* VII (1963), 57-68. Polly Hill, a developmental economist working on the innovative capacity of traditional farming techniques, also influenced Hopkins. See her works, *The Migrant Cocoa-Farmers of Southern Ghana: a Study in Rural Capitalism* (Cambridge: University Press, 1963); and *Studies in Rural Capitalism in West Africa* (Cambridge: University Press, 1970).

[39] Edward Reynolds, *Trade and Economic Change on the Gold Coast, 1807-1874* (London: Longman, 1974).

[40] Sara S. Berry, "The Concept of Innovation and the History of Cocoa Farming in Western Nigeria," *Journal of African History,* XV, 1(1974), 83-95.

[41] George E. Brooks, "Peanuts and Colonialism: Consequences of the Commercialization of Peanuts in West Africa, 1830-1870," *Journal of African History,* XVI, 1(1975), 29-54.

[42] D.C. Dorward, "An Unknown Nigerian Export: Tiv Benniseed Production, 1900-1960," *Journal of African History,* XVI, 3(1975), 431-459.

[43] Robert Harms, "The End of Red Rubber: a Reassessment," *Journal of African History,* XVI, 1(1975), 73-88.

[44] Hopkins called for more research on businesses in Africa; see his article, "Imperial Business in Africa," *Journal of African History,* XVII, 1(1976), 29-48; XVII, 2(1976), 267-290. For examples of business history, see A.G. Hopkins, "The Creation of a Colonial Monetary System: the Origins of the West African Currency Board," *African Historical Studies,* III, 1(1970), 101-132; Josephine Milburn, "The 1938 Gold Coast Cocoa Crisis: British Business and the Colonial Office," *African Historical Studies,* III, 1(1970), 57-74; K. Dike Nworah, "The West African Operations of the British Cotton Growing Association, 1904-1914," *African Historical Studies,* IV, 2(1971), 315-330; Raymond E. Dumett, "John Sarbah, the Elder, and African Mercantile Entrepreneurship in the Gold Coast in the Late Nineteenth Century," *Journal of African History,* XIV, 4(1973), 653-679; and Leroy Vail, "Mozambique's Chartered Companies: the Rule of the Feeble," *Journal of African History,* XVII, 3(1976), 389-416.

[45] Walter Rodney, *How Europe Underdeveloped Africa* (London: Bogle L'Ouverture Publications, 1972). Rodney borrowed the underdevelopment thesis from the Latin American intellectual, André Gunder Frank; see his *Capitalism and Underdevelopment in Latin America* (New York: Monthly Review Press, 1967). For a systematic critique of the underdevelopment thesis, see A.G. Hopkins, "On Importing André Gunder Frank into Africa," *African Economic History Review,* II, 1(1975), 13-21.

[46] Edward Alpers, *Ivory and Slaves: Changing Patterns of International Trade in East Central Africa to the Later Nineteenth Century* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1975), p. 8 ff. See also his article, "Gujarat and the Trade of East Africa, c. 1500-1800," *International Journal of African Historical Studies,* 9, 1(1976), 22-44. Alpers elaborated his concept of underdevelopment more explicitly in his article, "Re-thinking African Economic History: a Contribution to the Discussion of the Roots of Underdevelopment," *Ufahamu,* III, 3(1973), 97-129; republished in *Transafrican Journal of History,* V, 1(1975), 163-188.

[47] John Iliffe, *Agricultural Change in Modern Tanganyika* (Dar es Salaam, 1971); Roger van Zwanenberg, *The Agricultural History of Kenya to 1939* (Nairobi: East Africa Publishing House, 1972). See also R.M.A. van Zwanenberg and Anne King, *An Economic History of Kenya and Uganda, 1800-1970* (Atlantic Highlands: Humanities Press, 1975). For Malawi, see Martin Chanock, "Notes for an Agricultural History of Malawi," *Rural Africana,* 20 (1973), 27-35.

[48] Catherine Coquery-Vidrovitch, *Le Congo au temps des grandes compagnies concessionaires, 1898-1930* (Paris: Mouton, 1972).

[49] Coquery-Vidrovitch, *Le Congo,* pp. 509-514.

[50] Catherine Coquery-Vidrovitch, "L'impact des intérêts coloniaux: S.C.O.A. et C.F.A.O. dans l'Ouest Africain, 1910-1945," *Journal of African History,* XVI, 4(1975), 595-621. For other neo-Marxist perspectives on Western businesses in Africa, see Carl Widstrand, ed., *Multinational Firms in Africa* (Uppsala and New York: Scandinavian Institute of African Studies and Africana Publishing Co., 1975).

[51] Giovanni Arrighi, "Labour Supplies in Historical Perspective: a Study of the Proletarianization of the African Peasantry in Rhodesia," *Journal of Development Studies,* VI, 3(1970), 197-234.

[52] These two concepts relied on the substantivist assumption that African peasants merely acquired wealth to achieve social status within the "traditional sector" of a dual economy. W.J. Barber made the case for this in his book which Arrighi challenged, *The Economy of British Central Africa* (London: Oxford University Press, 1961). Elliott J. Berg applied models to all of Africa in his article, "Backward-Sloping Labor-Supply Functions in Dual Economies — the African Case," *Quarterly Journal of Economics,* No. 300, LXXV, 3(1961), 468-492. Marvin Miracle and Bruce Fetter subsequently rejected the notion that Africans reacted irrationally to economic incentives in their article, "Backward-Sloping Labor-Supply Functions and African Economic Behavior," *Economic Development and Cultural Change,* XVIII, 2(1970), 240-251; and Marvin Miracle, "Interpretation of Backward-Sloping Labor Supply Curves in Africa," *Economic Development and Cultural Change,* XXIV, 2(1976), 399-406.

[53] See, for example, Roger van Zwanenberg, "The Development of Peasant Commodity Production in Kenya, 1920-1940," *Economic History Review,* 2nd. Ser., XXVII, 3(1974), 442-454; Colin Bundy, "The Emergence and Decline of a South

African Peasantry," *African Affairs,* No. 285, LXXI (1972), 369-388; I.R. Phimister, "Peasant Production and Underdevelopment in Southern Rhodesia, 1890-1914," *African Affairs,* No. 292 LXXIII (1974), 217-228; and the related articles by Henry Slater, "Land, Labour and Capital in Natal: the Natal Land and Colonisation Company, 1860-1948," *Journal of African History,* XVI, 2(1975), 257-283; and W.G. Clarence-Smith and R. Moorson, "Underdevelopment and Class Formation in Ovamboland, 1845-1915," *Journal of African History,* XVI, 3(1975), 365-381.

[54] Philip Curtin, "Pre-Colonial Trading Networks and Traders: the Diakhanké," in *The Development of Indigenous Trade,* pp. 228-239.

[55] Philip Curtin, "The Lure of Bambuk Gold," *Journal of African History,* XIV, 4(1973), 623-631.

[56] Philip D. Curtin, *Economic Change in Precolonial Africa: Senegambia in the Era of the Slave Trade.* 2 vols. (Madison: University of Wisconsin Press, 1975).

[57] Curtin, *Economic Change,* p. 232.

[58] Curtin, *Economic Change,* p. 206.

[59] For other examples of economic model building in African history, see Henry A. Gemery and Jan S. Hogendorn, "The Atlantic Slave Trade: a Tentative Economic Model," *Journal of African History,* XV, 2(1974), 223-246; E. Phillip LeVeen, "The African Slave Supply Response," *African Studies Review,* XVIII, 1(1975), 9-28; and Robert Paul Thomas and Richard Nelson Bean, "The Fishers of Men: the Profits of the Slave Trade," *Journal of Economic History,* XXXIV, 4(1974), 885-914.

[60] Curtin, *Economic Change,* pp. 322-323.

[61] Curtin, *Economic Change,* pp. 247-253.

[62] Curtin, *Economic Change,* pp. 325-327.

[63] For other views of Curtin's work on Senegambia, see Catherine Sugy, Claudia D. Goldin, and Sara S. Berry, rev. of *Economic Change in Precolonial Africa,* by Philip D. Curtin, *African Economic History,* No. 1 (1976), 106-118.

[64] Paul E. Lovejoy, "Interregional Monetary Flows in the Precolonial Trade of Nigeria," *Journal of African History,* XV, 4(1974), 563-585.

[65] See Paul E. Lovejoy, "The Kambian Beriberi: the Formation of a Specialized Group of Hausa Kola Traders in the Nineteenth Century," *Journal of African History,* XIV, 4(1973), 633-651.

[66] Paul E. Lovejoy and Stephen Baier, "The Desert-Side Economy of the Central Sudan," *International Journal of African Historical Studies,* VIII, 4(1975), 551-581; and Stephen Baier, "Economic History and Development: Drought and the Sahelian Economies of the Niger," *African Economic History,* No. 1 (1976), 1-16.

Appendix:

Select Bibliography of Works in the Economic History and Economic Anthropology of Africa

Alagoa, E.J. "The Development of Institutions in the States of the Eastern Niger Delta." *Journal of African History,* XII, 2(1971), 269-278.

Alpers, Edward A. "Gujarat and the Trade of East Africa, c. 1500-1800." *International Journal of African Historical Studies,* 9, 1(1976), 22-44.

——. *Ivory and Slaves: Changing Patterns of International Trade in East Central Africa to the Later Nineteenth Century.* Berkeley: University of California Press, 1975.

——. Re-thinking African Economic History: a Contribution to the Discussion of the Roots of Underdevelopment." *Ufahamu,* III, 3(1973), 97-129. Republished in *Transafrican Journal of History,* V, 1(1975), 163-188.

Amin, Samir. *Neo-Colonialism in West Africa.* Baltimore: Penguin, 1973.

Arrighi, Giovanni. "Labour Supplies in Historical Perspective: a Study of the Proletarianization of the African Peasantry in Rhodesia." *Journal of Development Studies,* VI, 3(1970), 197-234.

Austen, Ralph A. "Patterns of Development in Nineteenth-Century East Africa." *African Historical Studies,* IV, 3(1971), 645-658.

Awe, Bolanle. "Militarism and Economic Development in Nineteenth Century Yoruba Country: the Ibadan Example." *Journal of African History,* XIV, 1(1973), 65-77.

Baier, Stephen. "Economic History and Development: Drought and the Sahelian Economies of Niger." *African Economic History,* No. 1 (1976), 1-16.

Barth, Frederick. "Economic Spheres in Darfur." *Themes in Economic Anthropology.* Ed. Raymond Firth. London: Tavistock, 1967, pp. 149-174.

Berg, Elliott J. "Backward-Sloping Labor Supply Functions in Dual Economies — the African Case." *Quarterly Journal of Economics,* No. 300, LXXV, 3(1961), 468-492.

Berry, Sara S. "The Concept of Innovation and the History of Cocoa Farming in Western Nigeria." *Journal of African History,* XV, 1(1974), 83-95.

Boahen, A. Adu. "The Caravan Trade in the Nineteenth Century." *Journal of African History,* III, 2(1962), 349-359.

Bohannan, Paul. "The Impact of Money on an African Subsistence Economy." *Journal of Economic History,* XIX, 4(1959), 491-503.

——. "Some Principles of Exchange and Investment Among the Tiv." *American Anthropologist,* LVIII, 1(1955), 60-70.

—— and George Dalton, eds. *Markets in Africa.* Evaston: Northwestern University Press, 1962.

—— and Laura. *Tiv Economy.* Evanston: Northwestern University Press, 1968.

Brooks, George E. "Peanuts and Colonialism: Consequences of the Commercialization of Peanuts in West Africa, 1830-1870." *Journal of African History,* XVI, 1(1975), 29-54.

Brown, Beverly. "Muslim Influence on Trade and Politics in the Lake Tanganyika Region." *African Historical Studies,* IV, 3(1971), 617-630.

Bundy, Colin. "The Emergence and Decline of a South African Peasantry." *African Affairs,* No. 285, LXXXI (1972), 369-388.

Chanock, Martin. "Notes for an Agricultural History of Malawi." *Rural Africana,* 20 (1973), 27-35.

Clarence-Smith, W.G. and R. Moorson. "Underdevelopment and Class Formation in Ovamboland, 1845-1915." *Journal of African History,* XVI, 3(1975), 365-381.

Cohen, Abner. "Cultural Strategies in the Organization of Trading Diasporas." *The Development of Indigenous Trade and Markets in West Africa.* Ed. Claude Meillassoux. Oxford: International African Institute, 1971, pp. 266-281.

Coquery-Vidrovitch, Catherine. *Le Congo au temps des grandes compagnies concessionaires, 1898-1930.* Paris: Mouton, 1972.

——. "L'impact des intérets coloniaux: S.C.O.A. et C.F.A.O. dans L'Ouest Africain, 1910-1945." *Journal of African History,* XVI, 4(1975), 595-621.

——. "Recherches sur un mode de production africain." *La Pensée,* No. 144 (1969), 61-78.

Curtin, Philip D. *The Atlantic Slave Trade: a Census.* Madison: University of Wisconsin Press, 1969.

——. *Economic Change in Precolonial Africa: Senegambia in the Era of the Slave Trade.* 2 vols. Madison: University of Wisconsin Press, 1975.

——. "The Lure of Bambuk Gold." *Journal of African History,* XIV, 4(1973), 623-631.

——. "Pre-Colonial Trading Networks and Traders: the Diakhanké." *The Development of Indigenous Trade and Markets in West Africa.* Ed. Claude Meillassoux. Oxford: Institute of African Studies, 1971, pp. 228-239.

—— and Jan Vansina. "Sources of the Nineteenth Century Atlantic Slave Trade." *Journal of African History,* V, 2(1964), 185-208.

Dalton, George. "Theoretical Issues in Economic Anthropology." *Current Anthropology,* X, 1(1969), 63-102.

Davidson, Basil. *Black Mother: the Years of the African Slave Trade.* Boston: Little, Brown, 1961.

Depelchin, Jacques. "A Contribution to the Study of Pre-Capitalist Modes of Production: Uvira Zone (Eastern Zaire), c. 1800-1937." *African Economic History Review,* II, 1(1975), 1-6.

Dike, K. Onwuka. *Trade and Politics in the Niger Delta, 1830-1885.* Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1956.

Dorward, D.C. "An Unknown Nigerian Export: Tiv Benniseed Production, 1900-1960." *Journal of African History,* XVI, 3(1975), 431-459.

Douglas, Mary. "Lele Economy Compared with the Bushong: a Study of Economic Backwardness." *Markets in Africa.* Ed. Paul Bohannan and George Dalton. Chicago: Northwestern University Press, 1962, pp. 211-233.

Duignan, Peter and L.H. Gann, eds. *Colonialism in Africa, 1870-1960: the Economics of Colonialism.* Vol. 4. Cambridge: University Press, 1975.

Dumett, Raymond E. "John Sarbah, the Elder, and African Mercantile Entrepreneurship in the Gold Coast in the Late Nineteenth Century." *Journal of African History,* XIV, 4(1973), 653-679.

——. "The Rubber Trade of the Gold Coast and Asante in the Nineteenth Century: African Innovation and Marketresponsiveness." *Journal of African History,* XII, 1(1971), 79-101.

Ehret, Christopher. "Agricultural History in Central and Southern Africa ca. 1000 B.C. to A.D. 500." *Transafrican Journal of History,* IV, 1-2(1974), 1-25.

Fage, J.D. *An Introduction to the History of West Africa.* Cambridge: University Press, 1955.

——. "Slavery and the Slave Trade in the Context of West African History." *Journal of African History,* X, 3(1969), 375-390.

Firth, Raymond, ed. *Themes in Economic Anthropology.* London: Tavistock, 1967.

Flint, Eric. "Trade and Politics in Barotseland during the Kololo Period." *Journal of African History,* XI, 1(1970), 71-86.

Gemery, Henry A. and Jan S. Hogendorn. "The Atlantic Slave Trade: a Tentative Economic Model." *Journal of African History,* XV, 2(1974), 223-246.

Gluckman, Max. *Economy of the Central Barotse Plain.* Livingstone, Northern Rhodesia: Rhodes-Livingstone Institute, 1941.

Godelier, Maurice. "Modes de production: rapports de parenté et structures demographiques." *La Pensée,* No. 172 (1973), 7-31. Translated as "Modes of Production, Kinship, and Demographic Structures." *Marxist Analyses and Social Anthropology.* Ed. Maurice Bloch. London: Malaby, 1975, pp. 3-27.

Gray, Richard and David Birmingham, eds. *Pre-Colonial African Trade: Essays on Trade in Central and Eastern Africa before 1900.* London: Oxford University Press, 1970.

Grayson, Leslie E. "A Conglomerate in Africa: Public-Sector Manufacturing Enterprises in Ghana, 1962-1971." *African Studies Review,* XVI, 3(1973), 315-346.

Harms, Robert. "The End of Red Rubber: a Reassessment." *Journal of African History,* XVI, 1(1975), 73-88.

Hartwig, Gerald. *The Art of Survival in East Africa: the Kerebe and Long-Distance Trade, 1800-1895.* New York: Africana Publishing Co., 1976.

——. "Economic Consequences of Long-Distance Trade in East Africa: the Disease Factor." *African Studies Review,* XVIII, 2(1975), 63-73.

Higgins, B. "The Dualistic Theory of Underdeveloped Areas." *Economic Development and Cultural Change,* IV (1956), 99-112.

Hill, Polly. *The Migrant Cocoa-Farmers of Southern Ghana: a Study in Rural Capitalism.* Cambridge: University Press, 1963.

——. *Studies in Rural Capitalism in West Africa.* Cambridge: University Press, 1970.

Hopkins, A.G. "The Creation of a Colonial Monetary System: the Origins of the West African Currency Board." *African Historical Studies,* III, 1(1970), 101-132.

——. "Economic Aspects of Political Movements in Nigeria and in the Gold Coast, 1918-1939." *Journal of African History,* VII, 1(1966), 133-152.

——. *An Economic History of West Africa.* London: Longman, 1973.

——. "Economic Imperialism in West Africa, Lagos; 1880-1892." *Economic History Review,* 2nd. Ser., XXI, 3(1968), 586-606.

——. "Imperial Business in Africa." *Journal of African History,* XVII, 1-2(1976), 29-48, 267-290.

——. "On Importing André Gunder Frank into Africa." *African Economic History Review,* II, 1(1975), 13-21.

Humphreys, S.C. "History, Economics, and Anthropology: the Work of Karl Polanyi." *History and Theory,* VIII, 2(1969), 165-212.

Iliffe, John. *Agricultural Change in Modern Tanganyika.* Dar es Salaam, 1971.

Johnson, Marion. "The Cowrie Currencies of West Africa." *Journal of African History,* XI, 1(1970), 17-49; XI, 3(1970), 331-353.

——. "The Nineteenth-Century Gold 'Mithqal' in West and North Africa." *Journal of African History,* IX, 4(1968), 547-569.

——. "The Ounce in Eighteenth Century West African Trade." *Journal of African History,* VII, 2(1966), 197-214.

Kaplan, David. "The Formal-Substantive Controversy in Economic Anthropology: Some Reflections on its Wider Implications." *Southwestern Journal of Anthropology,* 24, 3(1968), 228-251.

Klein, Martin A. "Social and Economic Factors in the Muslim Revolution in Senegambia." *Journal of Economic History,* XIII, 3(1962), 419-441.

Latham, A.J.H. "Currency, Credit and Capitalism on the Cross River in the Precolonial Era." *Journal of African History,* XII, 4(1971), 599-605.

——. *Old Calabar, 1600-1891: the Impact of the International Economy Upon a Traditional Society.* Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1973.

Legassick, Martin. "South Africa: Capital Accumulation and Violence." *Economy and Society,* III, 2(1974), 253-291.

LeVeen, E. Phillip. "The African Slave Supply Response." *African Studies Review,* XVIII, 1(1975), 9-28.

Lovejoy, Paul E. and Stephen Baier. "The Desert-Side Economy of the Central Sudan." *International Journal of African Historical Studies,* VIII, 4(1975), 551-581.

Lovejoy, Paul E. "Interregional Monetary Flows in the Precolonial Trade of Nigeria." *Journal of African History,* XV, 4(1974), 563-585.

——. "The Kambian Beriberi: the Formation of a Specialized Group of Hausa Kola Traders in the Nineteenth Century." *Journal of African History,* XIV, 4(1973), 633-651.

Low, D.A. and Alison Smith, eds. *History of East Africa.* Vol. 3. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1976.

McPhee, Allan. *The Economic Revolution in British West Africa.* London: G. Routledge, 1926.

Manning, Patrick. "Slaves, Palm Oil, and Political Power on the West African Coast." *African Historical Studies,* II, 2(1969), 279-288.

Mason, Michael. "Captive and Client Labour and the Economy of the Bida Emirate, 1857-1901." *Journal of African History,* XIV, 3(1973), 453-471.

Meillassoux, Claude. *Anthropologie économique des Gouro de Côte d'Ivorie: de l'économie de subsistance à l'agriculture commerciale.* Paris: Mouton, 1964.

——, ed. *The Development of Indigenous Trade and Markets in West Africa.* Oxford: International African Institute, 1971.

——. "Essai d'interprétation du phénomène économique dans les sociétés traditionnelles d'auto-subsistence." *Cahiers d'études africaines,* No. 4, I (1960), 38-67.

——. "Etat et conditions des esclaves a Gumbu (Mali) au XIXe siècle." *Journal of African History,* XIV, 3(1973), 429-452.

——. "From Reproduction to Production: a Marxist Approach to Economic Anthropology." *Economy and Society,* I, 1(1972), 93-105.

Mercer, Patricia. "Shilluk Trade and Politics from the Mid-Seventeenth Century to 1861." *Journal of African History,* XII, 3(1971), 407-426.

Milburn, Josephine. "The 1938 Gold Coast Cocoa Crisis: British Business and the Colonial Office." *African Historical Studies,* III, 1(1970), 57-74.

Miller, Joseph C. "Cokwe Trade and Conquest in the Nineteenth Century." *Pre-Colonial African Trade.* Ed. Richard Gray and David Birmingham. London: Oxford University Press, 1970, pp. 175-201.

——. "Legal Portuguese Slaving from Angola: Some Preliminary Indications of Volume and Direction, 1760-1830." *Revue française d'histoire d'Outre Mer,* No. 226-227, LXII (1975), 135-176.

Miracle, Marvin and Bruce Fetter. "Backward-Sloping Labor-Supply Functions and African Economic Behavior." *Economic Development and Cultural Change,* XVIII, 2(1970), 240-251.

Miracle, Marvin P. "Interpretation of Backward-Sloping Labor Supply Curves in Africa." *Economic Development and Cultural Change,* XXIV, 2(1976), 399-406.

——. "Plateau Tonga Enterpreneurs in Historical Inter-Regional Trade." *Rhodes-Livingstone Journal,* XXVI (1959), 34-50.

Mouser, Bruce L. "Trade, Coaster, and Conflict in the Rio Pongo from 1790 to 1808." *Journal of African History,* XIV, 1(1973), 45-64.

Mutibwa, Phares M. "Trade and Economic Development in Nineteenth Century Madagascar." *Transafrican Journal of History,* II, 1(1972), 33-63.

Newbury, C.W. "Credit in Early Nineteenth Century West African Trade." *Journal of African History,* XIII, 1(1972), 81-95.

——. "North African and Western Sudan Trade in the Nineteenth Century: a Re-Evaluation." *Journal of African History,* VII, 2(1966), 233-246.

Nworah, K. Dike. "The West African Operations of the British Cotton Growing Association, 1904-1914." *African Historical Studies,* IV, 2(1971), 315-330.

O'Fahey, R.S. "Slavery and the Slave Trade in Dār Fūr." *Journal of African History,* XIV, 1(1973), 29-43.

Phimister, I.R. "Peasant Production and Underdevelopment in Southern Rhodesia, 1890-1914." *African Affairs,* No. 292, LXXIII (1974), 217-228.

Polanyi, Karl. *Dahomey and the Slave Trade.* Seattle: University of Washington Press, 1966.

——. "Sortings and the 'Ounce Trade' in the West African Slave Trade." *Journal of African History,* V, 3(1964), 381-393.

——. *Trade and Market in the Early Empires: Economies in History and Theory.* Glencoe, Ill.: Free Press, 1957.

Reynolds, Edward. *Trade and Economic Change on the Gold Coast, 1807-1874.* London: Longman, 1974.

Rodney, Walter. "African Slavery and Other Forms of Social Oppression on the Upper Guinea Coast in the Context of the Atlantic Slave Trade." *Journal of African History,* VII, 3(1966), 431-443.

——. *How Europe Underdeveloped Africa.* London: Bogle-L'Ouverture Publications, 1972.

Sahlins, Marshall. "Economic Anthropology and Anthropological Economics." *Social Science Information,* VIII, 5(1969), 13-33.

——. *Stone Age Economics.* Chicago: Aldine, 1972.

Schneider, Harold K. *Economic Man: the Anthropology of Economics.* New York: Free Press, 1974.

——. *The Wahi Wanyaturu: Economics in an African Society.* Chicago: Aldine, 1970.

Seers, D. "The Stages of Economic Development of a Primary Producer in the Middle of the Twentieth Century." *Economic Bulletin of Ghana,* VII (1963), 57-68.

Slater, Henry. "Land, Labour and Capital in Natal: the Natal Land and Colonisation Company, 1860-1948." *Journal of African History,* XVI, 2(1975), 257-283.

Sundström, Lars. *The Exchange Economy of Pre-Colonial Tropical Africa.* London: C. Hurst and Co., 1974.

Suret-Canale, Jean. "Les Sociétés traditionnelles en Afrique noire et le concept du mode de production asiatique." *La Pensée,* No. 117 (1964), 19-42.

Terray, Emmanuel. "Classes and Class Consciousness in the Abron Kingdom of Gyaman." *Marxist Analyses and Social Anthropology.* Ed. Maurice Bloch. London: Malaby, 1975, pp. 85-135.

Thomas, Robert Paul and Richard Nelson Bean. "The Fishers of Men: the Profits of the Slave Trade." *Journal of Economic History,* XXXIV, 4(1974), 885-914.

Vail, Leroy. "Mozambique's Chartered Companies: the Rule of the Feeble." *Journal of African History,* XVIII, 3(1976), 389-416.

Vansina, Jan. "Long-Distance Trade-Routes in Central Africa." *Journal of African History,* III, 3(1962), 375-390.

——. "Pre-Colonial Trade." *Review of Pre-Colonial African Trade,* ed. Richard Gray and David Birmingham. *Journal of African History,* XI, 4(1970), 611-616.

——. *Kingdoms of the Savanna.* Madison: University of Wisconsin Press, 1966.

Widstrand, Carl, ed. *Multinational Firms in Africa.* Uppsala and New York: Scandinavian Institute of African Studies and Africana Publishing Co., 1975.

Wilks, Ivor. "A Medieval Trade-Route From the Niger to the Gulf of Guinea." *Journal of African History,* III, 2(1962), 337-341.

Wilson, Anne. "Long Distance Trade and Luba Lomani Empire." *Journal of African History,* XIII, 4(1972), 575-589.

Zwanenberg, Roger van. *The Agricultural History of Kenya to 1939.* Nairobi: East Africa Publishing House, 1972.

——. "The Development of Peasant Commodity Production in Kenya, 1920-1940." *Economic History Review,* 2nd. Ser., XXVII, 3(1974), 442-454.

—— and Anne King. *An Economic History of Kenya and Uganda, 1800-1970.* Atlantic Highlands: Humanities Press, 1975.